

MEMORANDUM
COUNTY OF PLACER
DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
PROCUREMENT SERVICES DIVISION

TO: Honorable Board of Supervisors

FROM: David Seward, Purchasing Manager *DS*

DATE: May 9, 2006

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Award Bid No. 9550 to Valley Relocation and Storage in the Maximum Amount of \$65,000.00 for Elections Drayage Services

ACTION REQUESTED

Award Bid No. 9550 to Valley Relocation and Storage of West Sacramento, CA in the maximum amount of \$65,000.00 for Elections Drayage Services, and authorize the Purchasing Manager to sign the resulting BPO.

BACKGROUND

The purpose of Bid No. 9550 was to select a contractor to provide Drayage Services for the Elections Division over approximately the next two years, including elections on June 6, 2006 and November 7, 2006. Services are to include staging election materials at the Elections Warehouse, delivering the materials to polling places on the day before the election, and picking them up and returning them to the warehouse on the day after the election. The Kiwanis Club has provided these services for the past sixteen years however the expected dollar amount of this contract required a formal bid. The bid requirements were very specific, requesting a single price per precinct that will apply to all 258 precincts, with no variation for geographic areas, and that will remain firm for two years. The bid included a fuel cost escalation factor to enable the successful bidder to recover increases in fuel cost. The bid also stated that references would be a factor in bidder selection.

Six firms and the Kiwanis Club submitted bids. Results are explained and tabulated in the attached "Evaluation of Bid No. 9550." Based on compliance with all of the bid requirements and on results of reference checks, the Elections Division has requested award to Valley Relocation and Storage.

FISCAL IMPACT

The resulting BPO in the maximum amount of \$65,000.00 will be effective from May 9, 2006 through November 30, 2007. The Placer County Elections Division budgets sufficiently for these necessary expenditures.

Attachment

Exhibit A, Evaluation of Bid No. 9550.

cc: Ryan Ronco, Elections

161

**MEMORANDUM
COUNTY OF PLACER
PROCUREMENT SERVICES DIVISION**

2964 Richardson Drive
Auburn, CA 95603

EXHIBIT A

TO: File
FROM: Jim Boggan
SUBJECT: Evaluation of Bid No. 9550

DATE: 4/18/06

Six Bidders responded to Bid No. 9550. Additionally, Mother Lode Van and Storage submitted a "No Bid" because they were already fully tasked during the performance period. The Kiwanis Club, the current vendor, submitted their bid plus an alternate bid, and included exceptions and modifications to the bid. The County's Invitation for Bids clearly stated that exceptions were not allowed.

Results are shown in the attached Bid Evaluation and Award Recommendation. Bid pricing was evaluated on Cost per Precinct, which was extended to provide total cost for the two planned elections. The bid also requested that bidders specify a fuel cost escalation factor to provide a fair means to reduce the risk to bidders of a significant rise in the price of fuel.

Auburn Van and Storage submitted the lowest priced bid. Their references include the Auburn Union School District, FBI, and California Public Employee's Retirement System (CalPERS). The bid asked for references from public agencies, similar to Placer County, for which the bidder has provided similar elections drayage services, and stated that reference checks would be a factor in bid award. Only one of Auburn Van's references could be contacted, (FBI) and it has been eleven years since they used Auburn Van. I called Auburn Van's General Manager, who confirmed that Auburn Van has never provided elections drayage services.

The Kiwanis Club submitted the next two apparent low bids. However, in his cover letter, Mr. Phil Baker stated that "Because the handicap ramps subject was not addressed we have to consider their delivery as a separate contract." I had informed Mr. Baker on April 4, 2006 that the Elections Department would not be able to quantify the number of ramps until shortly before each election, and that each bidder would have to estimate the number of ramps required. None of the other bidders took exception to this provision. Kiwanis also added Page 1A to Bid No. 9550, Attachment A, Page 1 of 2 (the Bid Form) that stated again that the cost of delivering any handicap ramps would have to be determined later.

Page 1A of Kiwanis' bids also excluded the Tahoe basin and surrounding area from the bidder's service area. The Invitation for Bids stated: "Pricing offered shall apply to all precincts/polling locations; separate pricing per geographic area shall not be accepted."

162

The Kiwanis bid, Page 1A added a requirement that the Elections Department provide a complete list of polling places and polling contacts to Kiwanis no later than 54 days prior to the Saturday before the election, or pay a \$25 per day fee for each day this requirement isn't met. None of the other bidders objected to a short notification period for the June election.

Finally, Page 1A stated that Kiwanis' responsibility would be to return all delivered equipment to staging areas in the warehouse, modifying the language in Addendum 2, Question 14 which requires the contractor to place the equipment back into the specific area in the warehouse where it was originally stored.

Kiwanis' primary bid is priced without providing statutory workers compensation insurance as specified by Addendum 2. Their alternate bid is priced to include statutory workers compensation. Kiwanis took exceptions to Addendum 2 of the bid: 1. As a non profit organization with no paid employees, they should not be required to provide workers compensation insurance; and 2. Kiwanis should be exempt from providing references to Placer County since they have delivered voter booths for the County for 16 years with no complaints from the Elections Department.

The exceptions taken by Kiwanis would require the County to negotiate a contract with them for delivery of HAVA equipment (ramps), would require the County to find and pay another provider for the Tahoe basin and surrounding area, and would add additional charges because there will only be approximately 40 days remaining before the election when the Board of Supervisors gives their award approval and the bid can be processed. With all these considerations, the Kiwanis bids are far less favorable than indicated on the attached spreadsheet. Total cost to the County is impossible to define at this time, but will be significantly higher than the bid price. None of the other bids took exceptions to any bid requirements.

Valley Relocations submitted the next lowest priced bid. Valley Relocations' references, including Alameda and Solano Counties, reported that Valley Relocations provided excellent elections drayage service during their previous elections.

Addendum 2 stated that reference checks will be a factor in selection of a successful bidder. Results of Valley Relocations reference checks were clearly superior to Auburn Van and Storage, which has never provided elections drayage services. The price difference between Valley Relocations and Auburn Van over the life of the contract would be \$8,999.04. Valley bid a lower fuel escalation factor, so rising fuel costs would narrow this difference. Based on compliance with bid specifications and requirements, bid prices and reference checks, the Elections Division selected Valley Relocations as the clear choice, best value contractor.


Jim Boggan, Senior Buyer



COUNTY OF PLACER, AUBURN, CA

BID EVALUATION & AWARD RECOMMENDATION

Bid No. 9550
Title: County Elections Drayage Services
Due Date: 3/23/04

Buyer Name: Jim Boggan
Phone: 530-889-4258
Estimated Award Date: 10/11/05

(Recommended award is highlighted)

Name of Firm City/State			Graebel West Sacramento, CA		Kwanis Club Auburn, CA		Kwanis Club San Jose, CA		Mother Lode Van & Storage Rancho Cordova, CA		Chipman Relocations Sacramento, CA		Valley Relocation Roseville, CA		SR Moving & Storage West Sacramento, CA								
Telephone Fax Number			916-617-2541 916-617-2570		530-745-9783 530-885-2985		530-745-9783 530-885-2985		916-631-4285 916-631-1722		916-563-7466 916-928-9787		800-830-7883 916-375-0042		916-371-6151 916-371-6181								
LVP Certified? ⁽¹⁾ Invoice Terms ⁽²⁾			No 1% / 15 or Net 30		Yes Net 30		Yes Net 30		No		No Net 30		No Net 30		No Net 30								
Item No.	Item Description	Qty	Cost per Precinct Unit Cost	Extension		Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension						
1	Cost per Precinct/Total Cost	516	200.00	103,200.00		115.00	59,340.00	119.00	61,404.00	0.00	0.00	200.00	103,200.00	118.00	60,888.00	446.25	230,265.00						
2	20% increase in fuel cost for November election	516	1.40	722.40		0.46	237.36	0.48	245.62	0.00	0.00	1.40	722.40	0.94	485.04	2.23	1,150.68						
3																							
(1) Local Vendor Preference is granted to those firms who file an LVP Affidavit with the County prior to the close of the bid.			Subtotal		103,922.40	Subtotal		59,577.36	Subtotal		61,649.62	Subtotal		0.00	Subtotal		103,922.40	Subtotal		61,373.04	Subtotal		231,415.68
(2) Invoice Terms of less than 20 days cannot be considered.			Bid Total		103,922.40	Bid Total		59,577.36	Bid Total		61,649.62	Bid Total		0.00	Bid Total		103,922.40	Bid Total		61,373.04	Bid Total		231,415.68
			LVP		0.00	LVP		2,978.87	LVP		3,082.48	LVP		0.00	LVP		0.00	LVP		0.00	LVP		0.00
			Ref. Price		\$103,922.40	Ref. Price		\$56,596.49	Ref. Price		\$58,567.14	Ref. Price		\$0.00	Ref. Price		\$103,922.40	Ref. Price		\$61,373.04	Ref. Price		\$231,415.68
					Low Bid		Unit price does not include delivery of ramps. Bid states that these deliveries will require a separate contract. KIWANIS BIDS EXCLUDE TAHOE AREA. ACTUAL COST TO COUNTY WILL BE HIGHER.					No Bid											

Low Bid

No Bid

164